

THE OTHER PINAKES AND REFERENCE WORKS OF CALLIMACHUS

FRANCIS J. WITTY

ABSTRACT

Recognizing the Mouseion's immediate need for reference works, Callimachus, in addition to compiling the great library catalog (*Pinakes*), also produced a large number of reference works in a myriad of subjects including anthropology, geography, history, ornithology, and literary history and criticism; two of them have the word *pinax* ("list") in their titles. The 16 works for which there is ancient or medieval testimony are listed with their fragments in English translation with brief commentary.

Some fifteen years ago I published an article in the *Library Quarterly* entitled "The Pinakes of Callimachus" [1] in order to make the twenty-five fragments of that frequently cited but elusive work completely available in English. As I noted at that time, the sources for these brief bits are mostly in Greek, and descriptive material is almost entirely confined to Latin and German. Thus, at this point it would seem—from my own knowledge of the current scene—that Callimachus is known to many American librarians only through the *Pinakes* (catalog of the Alexandrian Library), and this undoubtedly is considered the only prose work to come from the pen of the great poet during his extensive term as a resident scholar in the Mouseion at Alexandria. Of course, his poetic works are well known to classical scholars, but his scholarly prose works are usually almost ignored, principally because they no longer are extant and are merely mentioned or briefly cited by ancient and medieval writers.¹ Callimachus, however, belongs to a line of scholar-poets, beginning with Philetas of Cos,

who had the impetus for scholarly research from Aristotle and his successors, who had laid down principles for the methodical search for truth.²

Callimachus (ca. 305–ca. 240 B.C.) lived in an age that was fast losing contact with remote antiquity—with Homer, Hesiod, and, for that matter, with the lyric and dramatic poets of the fifth century. And it was up to those few enthusiasts who had the knowledge and the interest to preserve the literary heritage, to establish correct texts of the ancient authors, to explain their meanings and meters in commentaries, and to furnish lexica of the difficult and obsolete words to be encountered in their reading.

It was indeed fortuitous but fortunate that about this time the Ptolemies (successors in Egypt to Alexander, who was himself a pupil of Aristotle) were to foster these antiquarian pursuits through their government-funded haven for scholarship, the Mouseion, with its extensive library to aid the experts and in turn itself to be enriched by their scholarly and creative productions.

¹ E. A. Parsons [2, pp. 208–9] lists the *Mouseion* and *Pinax* of dramatic poets in addition to the *Pinakes*.

² Strabo (14. 657) calls Philetas "poet as well as scholar"; in a later section (17. 838) he refers to Callimachus as "poet as well as earnest literary scholar." See also R. Pfeiffer [3].

Subsidized scholarship (salaried think tanks) lends itself to the ridicule of the satirist, and the Mouseion was no exception, being likened by Timon of Phlius (320–230 B.C.) to a chicken coop where the inmates were well fed and quarreled among themselves:

Egypt has its mad recluses
Book-bewildered anchorites,
In the hen-coop of the Muses
Keeping up their endless fights.³

It is hard to imagine a group of closely associated and independently thinking geniuses—paid or not—cooped up in dovish tranquillity, when one recalls that they were the intellectual descendants of those fifth-century Greeks who loved nothing better than to argue any point on any subject whatsoever for hours on end in the Agora.

But the fact remains that in spite of the *odium philologicum* (or because of it?) an enormous amount of scholarly productivity took place at Alexandria: texts were established, commentaries were written, lexica were compiled, and various reference works were produced to aid the research of the Mouseion associates. It is these reference works which Callimachus compiled, in addition to his famous *Pinakes*, or *catalogue raisonné*, that are the subject of this paper.

The article on Callimachus (*Kallimachos*) in the literary encyclopedia of medieval Byzantium (ca. 1000), now referred to as *Suda* (formerly *Suidas*),⁴ states that Callimachus wrote some 800 books; and, after listing his poetic and

dramatic works, the article cites a number of titles (including the famous *Pinakes*) which a modern librarian would term “reference works.” These would provide invaluable assistance to the commentator on texts compiling *hypomnemata* (explanatory treatises) or *scholia* (explanatory notes) elucidating difficult passages in the works of the ancient authors. Among these are 2 works whose titles begin with the word *pinax* (list or table); thus, the term “other *pinakes*” in the title of this article.⁵ Of course, *Suda* is not the only source for these titles in every instance, but it provides a convenient starting point, and undoubtedly gets its facts from similar compilations made in Alexandria and elsewhere in the Hellenistic period and late antiquity. Other sources will be noted as the particular works are discussed. Reference works of Callimachus included in *Suda* are: *Shrine of the Muses (Mouseion)*, *The Pinakes (Alexandrian catalog)*, *Pinax and Chronological Register of Playwrights from the Beginning*, *Pinax of the Vocabulary and Writings of Democritus*, *Names of Months by Nationality and Cities*, *Founding and Naming of Islands and Cities*, *The Rivers of Europe*, *Marvels and Wonders of the Peloponnesus and Italy*, *Names of Fishes, Winds, Birds*, *Rivers of the World*, and *Collection of Wonders of the World Topographically Arranged*. To this impressive list scholars have added other works cited by ancient and medieval writers: *Contests*, *Foreign Customs*, *Foreign Names*, *Nymphs*, and a *Peri logadōn (Research on Selected Topics?)*, about which next

³ Translation of C. D. Yonge as quoted in [4, p. 87]. Pfeiffer [3, pp. 97–98] gives a more exact rendering, though with less verve: “Many are feeding in populous Egypt, scribblers on papyrus, ceaselessly wrangling in the bird-cage of the Muses.”

⁴ Cited fully (in Greek) in [5, vol. 1, p. xcvi].

⁵ The old, but still useful, dissertation of F. Schmidt [6] treats both the great *Pinakes* (catalog) and the other works beginning with the term *pinax*. See also O. Regenbogen under “Pinax” in [7, vol. 40, cols. 1418–24].

to nothing is known, including the correctness of the title.

The definitive collection of Callimachean fragments appears in volume 1, and their sources in volume 2, in the monumental work of Pfeiffer [5], who has put together in a critical edition all that is known of Callimachus, including ancient and medieval testimonia on his life and works. Anyone who studies Callimachus owes a tremendous debt to this outstanding work as well as to Pfeiffer's more recent *History of Classical Scholarship* [3],⁶ the third chapter of which is devoted to Callimachus and his pupils. The reference works of Callimachus are listed by Pfeiffer in alphabetical order by catchword of the Greek title under the heading "Fragmenta Grammatica" (fragments 403-64). I will follow his order in presenting the titles and testimonia; the fragment numbers and pages from volume 1 of that edition appear in parentheses after the English and Greek titles in this paper. I have not provided a complete translation of the citations in Pfeiffer in every instance; in fact under some works I have given merely a brief description. The actual quotations of the fragments are often extremely topical and hardly provide information about the work that is essential for our purposes here.

CONTESTS (403, p. 328)

This title does not appear in *Suda*, but is mentioned by an Alexandrian scholar, Valerius Harpocration, who compiled a *Lexicon of the Ten Orators*. Our title appears under the term

⁶For library history in Greek antiquity this work is indispensable, especially the section on "The Hellenistic Age" [3, pp. 87-151], where a number of "facts" that are constantly appearing in histories of libraries are summarily dispatched.

"Aktia": "*Aktia* was an ancient contest, which Callimachus plainly shows in his *Contests*." Pfeiffer notes that an older contemporary of Callimachus, Duris of Samos, a pupil of Theophrastus, had compiled an earlier work on contests, and that similar compilations were made later by Ister, a pupil of Callimachus, Cleophanes, and Theodorus of Hierapolis. Such a work would be of importance to scholiasts on Greek literature, much of which (for example, Pindar and the dramatists) was composed for various kinds of contests.

WINDS (404, pp. 328-29)

Although not accepted as genuine by some scholars, *Suda* includes it, and reference is made to works on *Winds* by Aristotle and probably by Callimachus in a commentary on Aratus by a third-century (C.E.) writer named Achilles Tatius: "Some winds, they say, come from the clouds and are called *eknephias*; others are produced by the earth, the *apogeioi*; others by rivers, the *exhydrias*; by bays, the *kolpias*; by the mountains, the *orias* or *orestias*; and, according to Aristotle in his *Winds* and according to Callimachus, certain winds consequently are named after places, such as the *Kaikias* blowing from the river Kaikos and the *Skeiron* from the Skeironidian rocks." As can be seen, the text does not actually mention this title of Callimachus; however, Bentley, as Pfeiffer notes here, had no doubts about the genuineness of the work as cited in *Suda* and hinted at in the citation of Achilles. As to the importance of such a work, the reader need only recall the frequency of roles which the winds play in much Greek literature (for example, Homer, Hesiod, and other epic, lyric, and dramatic poets).

FOREIGN CUSTOMS (405, p. 329)

This is one of the few titles not mentioned in *Suda*, although the earlier *Lexicon* of Photius, ninth-century metropolitan of Constantinople, cites it under the term "Phaselites' sacrifice": "Refers to the cheap and bloodless; because Callimachus says in his *Foreign Customs* that the Phaselites sacrificed a mummy to Cylabra." Works on foreign customs had been previously compiled by the fifth-century writer Hellanicus, by Aristotle, and possibly also by a contemporary of Callimachus, Nymphodorus of Amphilopolis. The cosmopolitan nature of Alexander and of his successors, especially the Ptolemies, who did not disdain foreign literature, would make such a compilation as this and the one following necessary tools for scholarship.

LOCAL NOMENCLATURE (406, p. 329)

The English title is the rendering of Pfeiffer [3, p. 135], who briefly discusses this work. Although not listed in *Suda*, it is cited by title in Athenaeus (7. 329A), where some names for small fish of the herring family are discussed: "Callimachus in his *Local Nomenclature* writes as follows: '*Enkrasicholos: eritimos at Chalcedon. Trichidia, chalkis, iktar: atherine at Athens.*' In another section listing names of fishes he says: '*ezaina: osmylion at Thurii. Iopes: eritimoï at Athens.*'" As Pfeiffer here remarks, Bentley decided that the work listed in *Suda* as *Names of Fishes* was, as seems obvious from Athenaeus, part of the larger work on *Local Nomenclature*, and Pfeiffer agrees with Bentley. But it still remains doubtful as to whether the books on *Winds, Birds*, and *Names of Months* were also parts of this work. According to a disserta-

tion by J. Schoenemann, cited here by Pfeiffer (*De lexicographis antiquis qui rerum ordinem secuti sunt* [Bonn, 1886], pp. 44-45), the items in this work were arranged in a classified order.

COLLECTION OF WONDERS OF THE WHOLE WORLD TOPOGRAPHICALLY ARRANGED (407-11, pp. 330-39)

This title, which appears last in the list of *Suda*, seems to have included, as a rather large part of its text, the separately listed title *Wonders and Marvels of the Peloponnesus and Italy*. The forty-four items which make up Pfeiffer's fragment 407 are taken from a work by Antigonus of Carystus (fl. ca. 240 B.C.), *Collection of Researches on Marvels*. Scholars believe that Antigonus either copied straight from the work of Callimachus or else used an epitome. He states: "Callimachus of Cyrene has made a certain selection of marvels of which we copied whatever seemed to us to be somewhat worthy of reporting." I will not list the forty-four quotations, but to give an idea of what one might find in such a work, here are a few of the wonders: floating bitumen (1), trees growing in the Indian Ocean (4), the Crathis River turns the hair yellow (6), another river stops leprosy (10), and the water of Lyncestae has such a tang that it makes one tipsy (36). Fragments 408-11 are more citations concerning the title from Stephanus of Byzantium (sixth century C.E.), Pliny the Elder, and an anonymous work on marvels in the Vatican Library. As Pfeiffer here notes, Callimachus probably used works of Aristotle, Theopompus, Theophrastus, Eudoxus, and others as sources for this compilation. The genre of literature called "paradoxography" had its beginning in Alexandria and is

actually believed to have been started by Callimachus and his contemporary, Bolus, who compiled a similar work [8, pp. 780–81, s.v. “paradoxographers”; 3, pp. 134–35].

RESEARCH ON SELECTED TOPICS (?)
(412, p. 339)

This strange title appears in the Ambrosian scholia to Theocritus, and may have been incorrectly copied, as is suggested by Pfeiffer in his remarks on this fragment: “*Quid Peri logadōn*—si recte traditur—significet, nescimus (What *Peri logadon* means—if the textual tradition is correct—we don’t know).” I have used the conjecture of Schneider, as cited by Pfeiffer, *eklektas historias*, for my English title. The scholium which mentions the title reads as follows: “Callimachus in the *Research on Selected Topics* says that the wreath of Dionysus was of apples, from which Hippomenes took at the request of Aphrodite—so says Diodorus the poet in his *Corinthians*.”

SHRINE OF THE MUSES
(no fragment, p. 339)

For the title of this work we have only the statement in *Suda*. A fourth-century scholar, Alcidas, had composed a work with the same title, but it is not extant either.

NAMES OF MONTHS BY NATIONALITY
AND CITIES (no fragment, p. 339)

The title comes from *Suda*, although, as Pfeiffer indicates under fragment 406 (p. 329) and in [3, p. 135], this may have been but a part of the larger onomasticon of number 406, the work on *Local Nomenclature*. Fragment 521 (p. 378) from the *Etymologicum genuinum*, although listed among those

citations of uncertain designation, has been suggested as belonging to this compilation, since it mentions Callimachus in reference to the name of a month. The importance of such a work as this becomes evident when one realizes that the various Greek communities had their own calendars with different names for the months [8, pp. 192–93, s.v. “calendars”].

FOUNDING AND NAMING OF ISLANDS
AND CITIES (no fragment, p. 339)

Again taken from *Suda* with no further corroboration. Pfeiffer (at number 464, p. 353) suggests that this work and the later one on rivers (numbers 457–59) might have been part of the *Commentaries (Hypommemata)* which are included in fragments 461–64.

NYMPHS (413, p. 340)

Not listed in *Suda*; it is mentioned in the *Anthology* of Stobaeus (1. 49, 50), where he cites Porphyry’s books *On the Styx*: “Callimachus in his work, *Nymphs*, also explains the peculiar character of the water in these words: ‘Styx: in Nonacrina in Arcadia, the water cracks all vessels save those of horn.’” Tzetzes, cited here by Pfeiffer, notes that the water’s coldness causes the vessels to crack.⁷ Fragment 777 (p. 482) is suggested as possibly belonging to this work; it comes from the lexicon of Hesychius and merely identifies the “Proselenides” as Arcadian nymphs. A work on nymphs, possibly prior to that of Callimachus, was compiled by Herodotus Olophyxius, as noted here by Pfeiffer.

⁷ The supplement to Liddell-Scott [9, p. 40] actually cites this fragment for the verb *diakoptō*, but gives its meaning here as “corrode”!

BIRDS (414–28, pp. 340–44)

In addition to its inclusion in *Suda*, we have no fewer than fifteen quotations from Athenaeus, Hesychius, Apollonius of Rhodes, and various scholia, especially of course, from Aristophanes' *Birds*, which attest to this work either by naming the exact title or at least by pointing to the fact that Callimachus composed a work on the subject. Pfeiffer (at 428, p. 344) says that the work seems to have consisted of 1 book (for example, fragment 414 states "in *the book on Birds . . .*" [italics mine] with the birds listed according to their kind (based on the listing particularly in fragment 427, where Callimachus's own words are quoted).

Fragments 429–53 concern the *Pinakes* of the Alexandrian Library, about which I have previously written [1]; but I would call attention to the more recent comments by Pfeiffer [3, pp. 126–34].

PINAX AND CHRONOLOGICAL REGISTER
OF PLAYWRIGHTS FROM THE
BEGINNING (454–56, pp. 349–50)

Although the title itself appears only in *Suda*, several items from antiquity point to the existence of the work, which very probably was based on the great *Didascaliae* of Aristotle (not extant) which was taken from the archives of the Athenian archon. As Pfeiffer says [3, p. 81], the Alexandrians did not have access to these files and so were dependent upon the compilations of Aristotle. The first fragment (454) comes from a scholium on Aristophanes' *Clouds* (1. 552), which reads: "Eupolis was the very first to drag on stage the *Marikas*." The note continues that it is evident that the *Marikas* was produced prior

to the revised version of the *Clouds*: "Eratosthenes says that Callimachus criticised the *Didascaliae* for dating the *Marikas* three years subsequent to the *Clouds*, since it is clearly stated that it preceded it. As Eratosthenes says, it has escaped Callimachus that no such statement occurs in the *Clouds* as it was produced: and there is nothing strange in its occurring in the remodelled play. It is obvious that the *Didascaliae* record only the produced play. How did [Callimachus] fail to see that Cleon was already dead in the *Marikas*, while, in the *Clouds*, it is stated [582] 'when the tanner, hated by the gods . . . ?'" [10, pp. li–lii]. Fragment 455 from another group of scholia on Aristophanes' *Birds* (1. 1242) "with Licymnian strokes," reads: "(a) In the drama *Licymnios* of Euripides someone on stage is struck by lightning. (b) Now Callimachus: 'writing thus *with Licymnian strokes*,' he says, 'he does not recall this *Didascaliae*.' In some of the commentaries of the learned one finds this: 'Perhaps *Licymnios* set fire to some peoples' houses.' In the notes of Apollonius this is written: 'that he brought on someone half-burned.'"

Concerning the same work of Callimachus, fragment 456 (p. 350) consists of three portions of what must have been an enormous inscription on the wall of a Roman library containing a *pinax* of playwrights which could well represent a direct copy of the work of Callimachus. The extant portions deal only with the comic playwrights Telecleides, Lysippus, and Anaxandrides, but the original inscription probably included plays from the very beginning of the dramatic festivals (contests). As it is, the remains show dates, awards, and places of per-

formance (Dionysian or Lenaian). The fragments of the inscription were found at Rome in 1762, 1777, and 1888; the first is now lost, but fortunately was published shortly after its discovery. Pfeiffer does not print these inscriptions in his edition because they are readily available in published studies.⁸

PINAX OF THE VOCABULARY AND
WRITINGS OF DEMOCRITUS
(no fragment, p. 350; also [3,
p. 132; 5, pp. 97-98])

We have only the title as listed in *Suda*, and one cannot be certain about the meaning of the term "*syntagma-ton*" in the title. Pfeiffer [3, p. 132] suggests "writings," and I have adopted that in my translation. Pfeiffer also remarks that it seems strange that there would be any need for a lexicon to Democritus, unless the work dealt with his treatise (not extant) on the language of Homer.

RIVERS OF THE WORLD
(457-59, p. 351)

This work, according to Pfeiffer, probably included as parts 2 other titles, one mentioned in *Suda*, *The Rivers of Europe*, and another cited in fragment 459 from the scholia on Apollonius of Rhodes, *Rivers of Asia*. Fragment 457 merely mentions the title as "the book *On rivers*" by Callimachus; it comes from the scholia, possibly, of Euphorion in an Oxyrhynchus papyrus fragment. Number 458 comes from Strabo and refers to the

work as "the collection of rivers" by Callimachus. And, as mentioned above, number 459 calls the work *Rivers of Asia*. Rivers play an important part in both imaginative and factual literature of Greek antiquity; thus, a work of this kind would be quite valuable to the scholiast.

AGAINST PRAXIPHANES
(460, pp. 351-52)

The title appears in Achilles' *Life of Aratus* and, as mentioned by Pfeiffer [3, pp. 135-36], the work was probably of literary criticism, and may have contained Callimachus's famous maxim "a big book is equivalent to a big nuisance." However, this maxim, cited by Athenaeus, is listed in Pfeiffer's edition under number 465 among *Incerti Libri*.

COMMENTARIES (462-64, pp. 352-53)

Though not listed in *Suda*, four separate sources attest to the title *Hypomnemata* by Callimachus. The meaning could be "commentaries" or "treatises." They might have been dissertations on aspects of language or grammar, if not actually commentaries on particular authors. The 4 fragments deal, respectively, with a myth about Hecuba turning into a dog, the term "melōdia" as an ancient name for tragedy, and two citations about place names. Pfeiffer also suggests [5, p. 353] that fragments 466 (p. 353) and 693 (p. 451), from various scholia on Theocritus, since they both deal with terms from ancient literature, might also have come from the *Hypomnemata*.

These 15 works, of course, could hardly be compared in importance and influence to the great *Pinakes*, which took up 120 papyrus rolls. But I felt that since Callimachus was responsible

⁸ See W. A. Dittmer [11]. The three restored fragments with English notes are included in A. Pickard-Cambridge [12, pp. 121-23]. The latter author notes that this compilation of Callimachus "must have been a standard work" [12, p. 69]. See also F. Schmidt [6, pp. 59-61].

for a great deal more in the way of reference works than for his famous classed catalog, librarians interested in the history of the book and of libraries should be made aware of this aspect of his productivity.

REFERENCES

1. Witty, Francis J. "The Pinakes of Callimachus." *Library Quarterly* 28 (April 1958): 132-36.
2. Parsons, E. A. *The Alexandrian Library*. Amsterdam: Elsevier Press, 1952.
3. Pfeiffer, Rudolfus. *History of Classical Scholarship from the Beginnings to the End of the Hellenistic Age*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1968.
4. Korte, A. *Hellenistic Poetry*. Translated by J. Hamner and M. Hadas. New York: Columbia University Press, 1929.
5. Pfeiffer, Rudolfus, ed. *Callimachus*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1949-53.
6. Schmidt, F. *Die Pinakes des Kallimachos*. Berlin: E. Ebering, 1922.
7. Pauly, Augustus Friederich von. *Paulys Realencyclopädie der classischen Altertumswissenschaft*. Stuttgart: J. B. Metzler, 1894-1959.
8. Hammond, N. G. L., and Scullard, H. H., eds. *The Oxford Classical Dictionary*, 2d ed. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1970.
9. Barber, E. A., et al., eds. *A Greek-English Lexicon: A Supplement*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1968.
10. Starkie, W. J. M. *The Clouds of Aristophanes*. London: Macmillan & Co., 1911.
11. Dittmer, W. A. *The Fragments of Athenian Comic Didascaliae Found in Rome (IG XIV 1097, 1098, 1098a)*. Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1923.
12. Pickard-Cambridge, A. *The Dramatic Festivals of Athens*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1953.